Graduate Council September 20, 2023 Meeting

September agenda

I. **Report of the Chair**
    a. Review and approval of May and April 2023 minutes (page 2-11)

II. Recognition of Graduate Council members rotating off
    a. Attila Yaprak, Marketing, MISB
    b. Cheol Lee, Accounting, MISB
    c. Malathy Shekhar, Oncoloy, SOM
    d. Golam Newaz, Mechanical Engineering, ENG
    e. Edward Cackett, Physics, CLAS
    f. Chera Kee, English, CLAS
    g. Marcus Dickson, Psychology, CLAS
    h. Athena Kheibara, Social Work, SSW
    i. Deborah Charbonneau, School of Information Sciences, SIS

III. **Old Business**

IV. **Adjournment**

Graduate Council May 17, 2023 Minutes

May agenda

V. **Report of the Chair**
   a. Review and approval of April 2023 minutes (page 2)
   b. Duo Lingo English Proficiency Test Score Change
VI. **Special Presentation:** Academic Senate Subcommittee Ad Hoc Subcommittee on AI Cheating (Richard Pineau, Associate Professor of Teaching, Math Department)
VII. **Executive Committee (Ed Cackett, Chair)**
   a. Graduate Student Incident at Academic Conference in Europe
   b. Recap of 5/10/23 Executive Committee meeting
VIII. NPPR and Awards and Fellowships updates (Todd Leff, Chair)
IX. AMP update (Todd Leff)
X. Interdisciplinary Policy/Committees
XI. Inclusive Excellence Committee update (Jasmine Ulmer, Chair)
XII. Pathway to Faculty update (Angulique Outlaw)
XIII. Student Senate report (Mohamed Dabaja)
XIV. New Business
XV. Report of the Academic Senate Liaisons
   a. Linda Beale, Academic Senate
   b. Robert Reynolds, Academic Senate Research Committee
   c. David Moss, Curriculum and Instruction Committee update
XVI. Adjournment

Attendees

Linda Beale, Paul Beasley, Ramona Benkert, Abe Biswas, Christine D'Arpa, Mohamad Dabaja, Marcus Dickson Jeremy Kodanko, Ed Cackett, Tamara Hew-Butler, Paul Johnson, Chera Kee, Loraleigh Keashly, Mahbub Islam, Todd Leff, Larry Matherly, David Moss, Angulique Outlaw, Deborah Patterson, Sarah Pearline, Jeff Pruchnic, Sherry Quinn, Stella Resko, Bob Reynolds, Young Ro-Yoon, Preethy Samuel, Malathy Shekhar, April Vallerand, Sally Villasenor, Jasmine Ulmer, Fred Vultee, Jen Wareham, Mary Wood, Attila Yaprak, Zhengping Yi

Absent

Amanda Bryant-Friedrich, Deborah Charbonneau, Cheol Lee, Jeffrey Martin, Dan Walz, Athena Kheibari

Guest

Richard Pineau

Ed Cackett, Executive Committee

Ed Cackett reported that benchmarking he conducted on criteria and procedures used to determine grad faculty status shows that Wayne State's practices are in-line with our peer institutions. Many peers have criteria set by individual units and then approved at the college level, Graduate School and Provost's office. He noted that units at WSU are given leeway in terms of the three scholarly products/activities required for renewal. It was noted by a GC member that the list of peers may be limited and not aspirational institutions. Cackett said the list is a starting point. Another GC member said his takeaway from the conversation with the Provost was that the scholarly activities/products should reflect the diversity of the various disciplines across campus. Linda Beale stated tha discussions in the Policy Committee focused on the need to have criteria coming from the units. The Academic Standards Committee will review the specific criteria in the fall when the committee reconvenes.

Academic Senate Subcommittee Ad Hoc Subcommittee on AI Cheating

Richard Pineau said the subcommittee's report was based on two months of work. The group had a limited charge given the short time frame. The first recommendation in the report deals with students. The second recommendation was a statement for a vote by the Senate plenary. The third recommendation recommends changes to the student code of conduct. Recommendation four is an update to the Academic Integrity module. He hopes to make this module available on Canvas to all instructors and include additional discussion on AI. The fifth recommendation concerns a syllabi statement. WSU has not taken an official stance on sylabbi

and his impression is that this question is up to individual faculty. However, there should be language for faculty who do want to prohibit the use of AI. In talking with OTL, it was recommended that rationale be provided to students in cases where AI use is prohibited. The committee did feel it was appropriate to distinguish between UG and grad classes. He noted that the use of AI to create data or for writing is not recognized by academic journals. The use of AI by some programs was discussed and those using AI have helped to provide structure and language for syllabi. The sixth recommendation looks at new faculty and student orientation, which plants the seed that academic integrity is important. Number 7 looks at the need for continued discussion. He said it's important to come back to the AI discussion on a regular basis and recommends putting the topic in the old business section of an agenda. Recommendation eight discusses support for instructors who may want to use AI as a teaching tool. The ninth recommendation looks at University priorities including an email to all instructors to remind them of available resources and detection software. The detection software is still under development, but the question is will one size work for all for the multiple AI systems out there. He next discussed admissions essays from applicants. The last point he discussed was privacy issues and the understanding that personal information that goes into these systems becomes the property of the developers.

A Grad Council member noted that some countries are banning the use of AI because of concerns related to health care privacy. Another Grad Council member said the Unicheck software used by WSU to check plagiarism has failed time and time again in cases of students plagiarizing from internal documents. He added that these checks are required a month before a PhD defense, which allows a student to plagiarize after the committee asks them to add things to a dissertation. He said the software does not work and the timing of using it is inappropriate. Another GC member suggested that faculty talk to OTL about use of AI. Pineau said that faculty are looking for tangible guidelines on, for example, how to frame writing prompts, which OTL may not currently provide. He said concrete recommendations on syllabi language are an example of what faculty are asking for. A question came up about Chat GPT and if there is a consistency of style with submissions. Pineau said the writing seems very flat and geared towards those who are not experts in the field. He added that Chat GPT has a consistent voice across several assignments and that Chat GPT creates an individual profile for each person. He said some people are saying we will do more oral exams, however this creates anxiety on the part of students. A question came up about asking Chat GPT to write an essay on plagiarism and if it would be the same output for all students in a class. Pineau said if you ask for sources, but they may not be legitimate. As an instructor, you need to spot check sources.

Continuation of Executive Committee Report

Ed Cackett resumed his report and said a graduate student was sexually harassed at an international conference. Once reported to conference organizers, the person accused was sent home. When the student returned home, various offices were contacted, however not much could be done since it was an international conference. The student and advisor are frustrated

since there is little recourse. He asked how we could support our students who attend conferences. It was suggested that WSU offer workshops and training where students are prepared for presenting at conferences. Linda Beale mentioned this issue may also confront undergrad students who are studying abroad. She said we at least should provide advice and counseling for students who experience this kind of situation. It was mentioned that there is a new office under the chief wellness officer with the title of Director of the Office of Sexual Violence and Prevention which may be helpful. Another Grad Council member said this issue is clearly the jurisdiction of the conference since it did not occur on our campus. Most conferences start out with a discussion at the beginning of what is permissible in terms of behavior. Cackett said he does not think this is outside of WSU's jurisdiction since we are sending students to conferences and we should support them. Another Grad Council member noted that students in these situations are vulnerable. Another member noted that the University has a responsibility to ensure students are in safe working spaces.

Awards and Fellowships Committee update

Leff said the goal of the committee is to determine if the Rumble Fellowships are being distribute equitably. Data has been compiled looking at seven-year PhD enrollment and degree completion. He noted that students must be full-time to qualify for the Rumble. The data will be presented to reflect the numbers of students in programs that are Rumble eligible. The intent is to come up with a way to make adjustments if there is a significant change in PhD enrollment. The committee will meet in fall.

Interdisciplinary Programs

A clear policy is needed for administration of these programs. A policy has been drafted based on a policy from another university. The Dean and Provost will discuss the policy and determine next steps.

Pathway to Faculty Update

Angulique Outlaw reported that scores are being compiled. The committee will convene to go over final rankings before getting approval from the Provost. The awarded departments will receive letters. Some departments are completing interviews.

AMP update

Leff said the program will be piloted in the School of Information Science, Kinesiology and the master's program in Pharmaceutical Science.

Report of the Student Senate Representative

Mohamed Dabaja said there is a new biodiversity sustainability initiative the Student Senate will soom hear about. Student groups met with the President regarding the group who came to campus and stomped on the Koran. The Senate will get on update on this meeting and what is being done to prevent this from happening again. Two Student Senate members are needed from Social Work and EACPHS.

New Business

The issue of plagiarism software detection programs used by WSU was put on the agenda for the next meeting by Todd Leff.

Report from the President of the Academic Senate Linda Beale

Undergraduate enrollments are moving up, but graduate enrollments are declining. She noted the efforts to increase master's enrollment in engineering appear to have payed off.

The Policy Committee has been discussing University-chartered centers. Discussions are ongoing regarding the proposed Center for Emerging and Infectious Diseases.

The Senate will be working over the summer on bylaws amendments. An affirmative straw vote was held on making the DEI Committee a standing committee. It will need to be officially approved at the September meeting. There is discussion on enlarging the membership of the Senate by including the chairs of the different schools/college faculty councils as automatic Senate members.

There has been a discussion about transcript holds. This can affect graduate students who have completed a bachelor's at WSU who can have a hold placed on their UG transcript if they owe money on their graduate program. Several committees looked at the issue and determined the current policy was unfair as it prevents students from getting a job and paying their tuition debt.

The Provost's Committee on PhD funding is meeting and looking at the number of graduate credits that make sense. There are five working groups. Another committee was established by the President to look at the formation of a School of Public Health. There is an exploratory committee. It was suggested that faculty forums be held to gather broad input. There is a considerable cost associated with the creation of a new school. Accreditation of this kind of school requires three PhD programs at a minimum.

The Board of Governors appears to be still narrowing the candidates for the new President. The list has gone from six to four. She said she has urged for an opportunity to provide real campus input on the finalists before a final decision is made, but this is looking unlikely. The Vice President for Research search is starting up again. A pool of candidates will be put together over the summer.

A Grad Council member who is also serving on the PhD funding committee added that any comments related to paying tuition of PhD students off faculty grants would be welcomed.

Report from the Academic Senate Curriculum and Instruction Committee David Moss

Moss said the committee has been discussing changes to the University's syllabus template in which all official university policy would be linked rather than having it be part of the syllabus, which can make the syllabus lengthy at 10+ pages.

Hearing no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:34 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mary E. Wood
Graduate Program Director

April 19, 2023

In person: 3rd Floor Community Room, David Adamany Undergraduate Library

Remote: https://wayne-edu.zoom.us/j/96443434131?pwd=L0hJY29kSXRjazZtTmZJTEJkT09EZz09

XVII.   Report of the Chair
   a. Review and approval of March 2023 minutes (page 2)
   b. Report on Master's Enrollment
XVIII. Executive Committee (Ed Cackett, Chair)
   a. Recap of 4/12/23 Executive Committee meeting
   b. *Graduate Faculty Status/Categories Proposal (attached)*
   c. *Housing interdisciplinary programs in the Graduate School*
XIX.   NPPR and Awards and Fellowships updates (Todd Leff, Chair)
XX.   Inclusive Excellence Committee update (Jasmine Ulmer, Chair)
XXI.   Pathway to Faculty update (Angulique Outlaw)
XXII.   Student Senate report (Mohamed Dabaja)
XXIII. New Business
XXIV.   Report of the Academic Senate Liaisons
   d. Linda Beale, Academic Senate
   e. Robert Reynolds, Academic Senate Research Committee
   f. David Moss, Curriculum and Instruction Committee update
XXV.   Adjournment

Attendees:

Amanda Bryant-Friedrich, Linda Beale, Paul Beasley, Abe Biswas, Deborah Charbonneau, Jeremy Kodanko, Ed Cackett, Christine D'Arpa, Tamara Hew-Butler, Paul Johnson, Chera Kee, Loraleigh Keashly, Mahbub Islam, Todd Leff, Jeffrey Martin, David Moss, Angulique Outlaw, Deborah Patterson, Jeff Pruchnic, Sherry Quinn, Stella Resko, Bob Reynolds, Young Ro-Yoon, Preethy Samuel, Malathy Shekhar, April Vallerand, Sally Villasenor, Jasmine Ulmer, Fred Vultee, Jen Wareham, Mary Wood, Attila Yaprak, Zhengping Yi

Absent:

Mohamad Dabaja, Marcus Dickson, Sarah Pearline, Ramona Benkert, Cheol Lee, Dan Walz, Athena Kheibari, Larry Matherly

Linda Beale had to leave early. She presented her report first.

<u>Linda Beale, Academic Senate President</u>

A preliminary report of the Ad Hoc Subcommittee of the Artificial Intelligence (AI) Cheating has been drafted and presented to the Policy Committee. It will be discussed again at the Senate's plenary session. The goal is to guide student about reasonable uses of AI to maintain academic integrity and the development of an academic integrity module. Faculty use of AI is also considered. She said it's likely that detection software will be a profit-making enterprise begging the question on how much it will cost the university to subscribe. Changes to the student code of conduct may also be needed.

She next discussed the President's email discussing what was viewed as a threatening social media post by a WSU English professor. She expressed concerns that the email identified the English Department. She mentioned the fact that she was not consulted regarding the email. It was noted that the communication started as a Facebook post and then was more widely disseminated. She said the email had a chilling effect and can negatively impact a career. She asked for input from the Council regarding this matter.

<u>Report of the Chair</u>

Dean Amanda gave a presentation on master's enrollment over the past five years. The College of Education was first showing the number of students enrolled over the past five years has not been vastly different. She noted that there are differences across schools/colleges in term of admission procedures. Engineering was next showing a decline in application perhaps due to international students not applying during the pandemic because of closed borders. A low yield was noted. CLAS was next. Some programs here are almost exclusively domestic whereas some are primarily international. With CLAS, it's most helpful to break down by program. She added that public administration has experienced substantial declines in enrollment. Nursing followed with declines. FPCA had a serious bump in following 2020 with 30 students in one program jumping to 333 applicants. It was noted that a cohort is admitted every three years for this particular FPCA program causing the bump. EACPHS experienced a similar bump in a program but that was attributed to a particular change that impacted the number. MISB has also experienced significant declines. This is a national trend for MBA programs. The SIS fully on-line master's program was next and it was noted that the cost of online programs can be a deciding factor for students. A grad officer noted that many students may start an application, but do not complete which may impact the number. The Dean mentioned the retention and completion factors which were not part of this data set. Time to degree is another important metric. The Dean added that in general, master's enrollments are down around the country with the exception of the West Coast. Fewer numbers of males was also noted. The discussion turned to the online offerings from the School of Social Work. Some faculty do better in the online space vs. in-person and vice versa. One of the questions from students regarding on-line programs is 'will we still be part of a community?'. Grad Council members offered examples of community building in on-line programs mentioning in-person orientation and other methods

to build a sense of community. They said students don't want to come to class, but they do want to be part of social justice initiatives and social events.

English Proficiency Exams for Applicants to Chemistry Master's Programs

A question was brought up if prospective 3+2 students to be admitted to the MA program without an English proficiency test score.   The issue is if these students can submit the score at a later time, after they are admitted. Slate does not allow advisors to place applications in the first review bin to proceed with the admission without the test score. Because of the missing English test score it marks the application as incomplete. There was discussion about faculty in the department interviewing these students to determine their English proficiency. The Dean noted this requirement is an issue of standards and that one faculty member's view of English proficiency may be entirely different than another faculty member's. Process and procedures need to come up to scrutiny, she said. She also said there needs to be consideration given to the students we are graduating and the fact that they may not be proficient in English. She said the Grad School has responsibilities to ensure that students who come to the university can meet and fulfill requirements. The goal is not to hinder bringing in new students.

Executive Committee

Grad faculty status was discussed with the Provost before the full Grad Council. Ed Cackett recapped this discussion. The requirement for three scholarly products in five years was a bone of contention. Perhaps there should be a more varied definition of scholarly products since it varies so widely from field to field. There was also discussion regarding giving the departments more say in terms of determining who among their faculty qualifies for grad faculty status given the nuances of each field. During this discussion, it was noted that faculty productivity varies at various points in a career. Cackett reported that the Provost said he would not qualify for grad faculty status using the current criteria. A grad program officer spoke on behalf of the current criteria saying that faculty should keep up on current research and be active in their field. This is critical to them effectively advising PhD students. If faculty remain productive, it helps to set up students for success once they graduate and are on the job market. She added that WSU is a R1 institution and its imperative to a student's social capitol to have an active advisor. In the future, the Graduate School will review the current criteria language for grad faculty status.

The interdisciplinary programs were next discussed. The Provost has recommended that a "faculty of record" be established for these programs. These programs can be housed within the Grad School as long as faculty of record has been put in charge. Technical changes will be made to Course Leaf to ensure that multiple departments can approve of new interdisciplinary programs/course work.   The Grad School will define the responsibilities of the faculty of record to include how they can be removed and replaced. The two programs currently being considered are both associated with grant proposals.

NPPR

No report.

Academic Standards

No report.

Inclusive Excellence Committee Report, Jasmine Ulmer, Chair

Ulmer reported that Dean's Diversity Fellows have been selected and they are the following:

Psychology – White
Cancer Biology – Temby
Political Science – Olvera
Physics – Hernandez
English – Brown

The next fellowship for consideration is the King-Chavez-Parks Future Faculty Fellowship award. These applications are administered by the State of Michigan. Students apply directly to the state and we don't have immediate access to the pool of applicants. Notification on the applicants will come from the state shortly. There was discussion about the rubric for this award. The deadline for scoring applicants is at the end of May.

Awards and Fellowships Committee update

The Committee continues to compile and analyze the data on Rumble awards. A report will be presented at an upcoming meeting.

Report of the Student Senate Representative

No report.

Reports of the Academic Senate Liaisons to the Research Committee and the Curriculum and Instruction Committee will be provided at the May 2023 meeting.

Hearing no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mary E. Wood
Graduate Program Director